

# Using ESG ratings: Motivations, benchmarking, and performance

Irene Andersen<sup>a, b, 1</sup>, Dennis Bams<sup>a, b, 2</sup> and Roger Otten<sup>a, c, 3</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Maastricht University, School of Business and Economics, PO Box 616, 6200 MD Maastricht, Netherlands

<sup>b</sup> Open University Heerlen, Faculty of Management Science, Valkenburgerweg 177, 6419 AT Heerlen, Netherlands

<sup>c</sup> ABP, Oude Lindestraat 70, 6411 EJ Heerlen, Netherlands

## Abstract

Blind trust in composite ESG ratings can lead to biased managerial and/or investment decisions that severely impact social, environmental, and financial performance. We illustrate this bias in two separate settings: an environmental- and a risk management setting. Our findings reveal that existing ESG ratings do not adequately distinguish between display of commitment to environmental management and actual pollution levels. We propose a commitment and a pollution's measure and show that only the pollution measure can predict the chance of receiving an environmental fine. In the risk management setting, where composite social scores have been used to capture social capital, we build a stakeholder loyalty score. We demonstrate that stakeholder loyalty better captures the notion of social capital through firms observing lower probabilities of default.

**JEL classification:** A13, C12, M48, Q01

**Keywords:** ESG, Environmental Management, Risk Management, Rating Performance, ESG motivation

---

<sup>1</sup> *Corresponding author:* T +47 45 46 81 89 | [jorunnirene.andersen@kristiania.no](mailto:jorunnirene.andersen@kristiania.no)

Present address: Kristiania University College, School of Economics, Innovation, and Technology, PB 1190 Sentrum, 0107 Oslo, Norway

<sup>2</sup> T +31 6 504 55 780 | [w.bams@maastrichtuniversity.nl](mailto:w.bams@maastrichtuniversity.nl)

<sup>3</sup> Disclaimer: The views and opinions expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of ABP | [r.otten@maastrichtuniversity.nl](mailto:r.otten@maastrichtuniversity.nl)